

Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati/Christopher Rowland (Hg.), Approaches to the Visual in Religion

V&R

Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati/Christopher Rowland (Hg.), *Approaches to the Visual in Religion*

Research in Contemporary Religion

Edited by

Hans-Günter Heimbrock, Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati, Bryan P. Stone,
Heinz Streib, Claire Wolfteich, Trygve Wyller

In Co-operation with

Sunhee Ahn (Seoul, Korea), Bärbel Beinhauer-Köhler (Frankfurt/Main,
Germany), Wanda Deifelt (São Paulo, Brazil), Jaco S. Dreyer
(Pretoria, S. Africa), Mehmet Emin Köktas (Izmir, Turkey),
Bonnie J. Miller-McLemore (Nashville, USA), Siebren Miedema
(Amsterdam, The Netherlands), Bradd Shore (Atlanta, USA), David M. Wulff
(Norton, USA), Margaret Yee (Oxford, UK), Dale P. Andrews
(Boston, USA), Hanan Alexander (Haifa, Israel), William Storrar
(Princeton, USA), Carla Danani (Macerata, Italy)

Volume 10

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Approaches to the Visual in Religion

Edited by
Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati
Christopher Rowland

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

With 81 Figures

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

ISBN 978-3-525-60442-7

Published with the support of the Swiss National Science Foundation.

© 2011, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen /

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht LLC, Oakville, CT, U. S. A.

www.v-r.de

Alle Rechte vorbehalten. Das Werk und seine Teile sind urheberrechtlich geschützt.

Jede Verwertung in anderen als den gesetzlich zugelassenen Fällen bedarf der

vorherigen schriftlichen Einwilligung des Verlages. Hinweis zu § 52a UrhG:

Weder das Werk noch seine Teile dürfen ohne vorherige schriftliche Einwilligung

des Verlages öffentlich zugänglich gemacht werden. Dies gilt auch bei einer

entsprechenden Nutzung für Lehr- und Unterrichtszwecke.

Printed in Germany.

Satz: textformart, Göttingen

Druck und Bindung: ☉ Hubert & Co, Göttingen

Gedruckt auf alterungsbeständigem Papier.

*In memory of
Melanie Wright
(1970–2011)*

“The pushke contains the possibility both to be sad,
that one does not have the opportunity to visit the shtetl of one’s grandparents,
and to be glad, that one does not have to remain there.”

(Melanie Wright, “Material Judaism”)

“People like Melanie do not leave. Every step of her adult life was
genesis of eternity: the way she lived and shared her life with others
gave her lasting presence in humanity. Carrying on her passion for writing,
her book of life shall never close. Now it’s our turn to write the next one,
with the helping hand of her legacy.”

(Lucia Faltin, friend of Melanie)

We acknowledge with grateful thanks Jörg Persch and Christoph Spill of Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht for accepting the book for publication, and the University of Zurich and the Swiss National Science Foundation which have generously assisted with the publication costs. We are indebted to Sean Ryan for his outstanding editorial skills which have greatly improved our typescript.

Finally, the book is dedicated to the memory of one of our contributors, Melanie Wright, who died as the book was in the final stages of preparation for publication. Her untimely death has robbed us all of a colleague of great humanity whose intellectual contribution to our work speaks for itself in this book: "And I heard a voice from heaven saying, Write this: Blessed are the dead who die in the Lord. Blessed indeed, says the Spirit, that they may rest from their labours, for their deeds follow them".

Contents

Preface <i>Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati, Christopher Rowland</i>	9
Part I: Perspectives from the Study of Religion	
Introduction <i>Anna-Katharina Höpflinger, Marie-Therese Mäder</i>	17
Images in Images Self-Reflexivity in Votive Paintings from the 19 th Century <i>Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati</i>	21
From Visibility to Invisibility A Semiotic Approach to Marduk's Battle against Tiāmat on a Relief from Palmyra <i>Anna-Katharina Höpflinger</i>	39
Material Judaism Interpreting the Pushke <i>Melanie J. Wright</i>	51
Viewing and Reconstructing Caricatures The "Other" in Benjamin Roubaud's <i>La leçon de danse</i> <i>Monika Glavac</i>	65
Multilayer Reality in Documentary Film An Approach towards a Critical Reading of Documentary Films on the Basis of ARUKIHENRO (T. Mendel, CH 2006) <i>Tommi Mendel</i>	79
A Cultural Studies Approach to Film and Religion Context and Film Analysis of YES (S. Potter, GB/USA 2004) <i>Marie-Therese Mäder</i>	101
Censorship as Self-Representation Interpreting the Banning of I ACCUSE (W. Liebeneiner, D 1941) in Switzerland <i>Fabian Perlini-Pfister</i>	119

Part II: Hermeneutical Perspectives

Introduction <i>Davide Zordan</i>	135
--------------------------------------	-----

A Hermeneutical Approach to Text-Image-Interactions Friedrich Dürrenmatt's Reception of Don Quixote <i>Pierre Bühler</i>	139
--	-----

Seeing, Touching, Feeling the Word Rembrandt's <i>Old Woman Reading</i> <i>Davide Zordan</i>	153
--	-----

Seeing is Believing Representations of Women in the Luther Bible of 1534 <i>Ann Jeffers</i>	169
---	-----

A Reflection on Aesthetic Engagement in the Light of Blake's Hermeneutic Viewing <i>The Nativity</i> <i>Christopher Rowland</i>	187
---	-----

Part III: Theological Perspectives

Introduction <i>Zoë Bennett</i>	201
------------------------------------	-----

A Case Study in Visual Exegesis Hans Memling's <i>Apocalypse Panel</i> <i>Natasha O'Hear</i>	205
--	-----

Literary Images Divine Violence on Stage in Exodus 15: 1–18 <i>Debora Tonelli</i>	221
---	-----

Images of Sex and Death as a Challenge for Theology Reflections on <i>MATADOR</i> (P. Almodóvar, E 1986) <i>Stefanie Knauss</i>	235
---	-----

Creation Made Image and Image Made Word John Ruskin on J. M. W. Turner's <i>Snow Storm</i> <i>Zoë Bennett</i>	249
---	-----

Contributors	261
List of Figures	264
Index	266

Preface

Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati
Christopher Rowland

The essays in this volume investigate the analysis of visual sources and their indispensable role for understanding and interpreting religions, their symbol systems, and the wider traditions of which they are a part. A particular interest in this study is the focus on the methodological challenge of images from a comparative perspective.

The common concern that ranges across all the contributions is the search for a methodological perspective in which images may be analysed in a comprehensive way, paying particular attention to the social, and wider intellectual, settings, as well as the religious frameworks, in which the images are embedded. Accordingly, we seek to show that visual sources need to be interpreted from different angles, not only by considering their visual elements, but also their origins and material aspects, as well as their hermeneutical effects.

In the last few decades, a broad range of publications have contributed to a greater appreciation of the significance of images, and visual media in general, in understanding religious traditions, communities and discourses from both historical and contemporary perspectives.¹ Of course, attention to sources other than texts and writings has always been present in the field of religious studies. Nevertheless, visual sources have been, and partially continue to be, considered more marginal, at the boundaries of disciplines dealing with religions.

In more recent research, centring on visual media in religious traditions and symbol systems, various avenues have opened up and been explored, focusing on the status of images and on the perspective of the viewer. Furthermore, there are illuminating contributions dealing with the theoretical premises and methods by which to approach the visual as a central component of religion, some providing an overview of essential definitions and implications, whilst others concentrate on specific techniques and/or media.²

1 For a survey of this field see Cancik/Mohr 1988, Plate 2002, Landwerd 2002, Bräunlein 2004, Morgan 2005, 2008.

2 The bibliography in this area is very broad. The following select examples provide informative contributions from differing approaches to the field of religion and visibility: Miles 1985, Morgan 1998, Arweck/Collins 2006, Hoover 2006, Blizek 2009, Beinhauer-Köhler/Pezzoli-Olgiati/Valentin 2010. Select examples of illuminating contributions from visual study and art-history include: Mitchell 1986, Beyer 1996, Macho 2000, Belting 2000, 2001, 2008, Böhm 2004, Pattison 2007.

This volume emerges out of this diversity of contemporary approaches within the field of visuality and religion. As a creative response to this diversity, the present volume focuses, in particular, on questions of method and approach to visual sources. Based on the premise that visual communication is an essential part of religious traditions in both the past and present, the contributions assembled in this book are concerned with the analysis of selected visual documents and their contribution to general theoretical questions. They explore appropriate means of understanding visual sources, attentive to the different historical settings in which they are embedded, and the different theoretical frames within which the questions driving the analysis are generated.

This volume is based on an interdisciplinary conversation among colleagues involved in different disciplines concerned with religion: the study of religion with reference to historical and contemporary religious case studies; biblical studies, systematic and practical theology; and hermeneutics. The task has been to produce common lines of interest as well as to trace emerging lines of continuity and discontinuity between the approaches.

Surveying the whole volume and the distinct disciplines it encompasses, some common points of interest and evaluation may nonetheless be highlighted in this preface. There is no intention in this collection to offer *one* comprehensive method which might encompass every conceivable interpretation of every type of image. Rather, in the book we discuss both the opportunities and limits of different approaches, as well as the necessity of correlating and combining those different approaches, in order to capture the interpretative complexity required to interpret visual media. The proposed approaches to the visual offer consideration of a process of communication that may be applied to a broad range of artefacts, products and objects. Each contribution explores and evaluates different possibilities, presenting a variety of case studies from different historical contexts, ancient and contemporary. Each contributor assesses the question of method as comprehensively as possible, and from different perspectives, considering images and visual communication as integral parts of cultural processes and of the religious representations and traditions in their respective cultures.

The visual communication process always involves some kind of viewer. Even in instances where the viewers are invisible, or absent, images may still be perceived as part of a complex, multi-layered communication process. The relationship between an image and its viewers can be analysed from an historical and a hermeneutical perspective, involving both the moment of production and the ongoing process of reception in which the image is embedded. The dynamic between historical, imaginary or imagined visual sources and viewers, is the foundation for this form of communication and concerns not only the historical reconstruction of a particular original setting but also potential possibilities for reception in very different contexts.

Also relevant is the relationship between the researcher and the visual sources he or she is investigating. Although these considerations may be regarded as secondary, nonetheless, within a general methodological reflection, they should not be underestimated or ignored. In fact, the admission of one's own involvement as a viewer of the images on which one is undertaking research, opens the door to the crucial issue of the role of the particularity of subjectivity in academic enquiry.

Given the immediacy and the emotional involvement of the visual gaze, the subjective and cultural imprint has a greater, and more obvious, impact here than in other fields, perhaps even more obviously than in textual study (though we would want to emphasise its central importance there also). Obviously, there is the necessity of contextualising one's own academic perspective on visual media. For instance, the mediating role of dealing with foreign languages and translations that is paramount in classical religio-historical work is much less present in visual fields, where the source is perceived primarily through the sense of sight, albeit culturally conditioned. The hermeneutical challenge of interpreting images belongs essentially and specifically to the investigation of visual issues as they confront the viewing subject.

Furthermore, it is important to consider both the necessity and the limits of socio-historical contextualisation. When investigating religious traditions, the distinction between the context of production and the multiple contexts of reception is essential. The dialectic between production and reception opens up a broad range of frames for interpretation. This allows the interpreter to conceive of visual communication as a communication not only at a particular historical moment but also as a dynamic articulation through time and traditions. A comparison between different stages of transmission and reception presupposes the materiality of the image as a constant characteristic (though obviously changing through age and use), in contrast to the variable modes of interpretation in the reception process.

The investigation of visual sources from the perspective of the different historical, social, cultural, and geographical settings covered in this project has suggested some specific characteristics of visual communication as a complex part of culture. This has demonstrated the fact that language cannot deal with the visual in anything like a comprehensive way, precisely because language confines and reduces the impact of images whose interpretative effects can never adequately be communicated in textual form. Between images and language, as different modes of intellectual engagement, there lies a gap one must always keep in mind. The difference between text and image is not absolute, as a written text is itself also an artefact, perceived visually in its materiality and form whose overall effect also produces mental images.

The various case studies, where different methods are critically discussed, are presented in three different parts.

In the first part of the book, the essays are very much part of the study of religion, and deal with visual sources from a largely descriptive perspective, looking

for the significance of images and their role in the processes of the construction of meaning. Images are here considered within a process of communication which is subject to continuous fluctuations and changes.

In the second part, we have a series of contributions in which the interpretative process is itself at the centre of attention. Visual communication develops in its own way, but it is always integrated into a network of interpretative mediations. A multi-faceted hermeneutical reflection can help to distinguish and correlate the various moments in the interpretative process, therefore, not least those in which images are often aligned with texts and literary traditions. Furthermore, the hermeneutical approaches mediate between, and clarify, subjective involvement and critical distance, with both as necessary poles in processes of interpretation.

The third part contains contributions in which the visual is considered in relation to the hermeneutically productive moment and its relation to wider theological reflection. From this perspective, images are not only the object of academic enquiry but also a stimulus to new thinking within contemporary theological discourse.

At the beginning of each new part, a short introduction characterises the contributions it contains by outlining the main lines in common.

The articles collected in this volume were conceived, written, and discussed over the last few years at the regular meetings of researchers in the fields of biblical studies, theology, hermeneutics, and the study of religion, based in the United Kingdom, Switzerland, and Italy in a research project originating from cooperation between the Faculties of Theology at the Universities of Oxford and Zurich, which the editors of this volume initiated. In addition to the previously mentioned interdisciplinary character of the meetings, the collection of essays presented in this volume also displays a plurality of academic traditions and conceptions of disciplines that is typical of contemporary European research. It is hoped that this broad spectrum of approaches to the visual will stimulate other scholars to investigate and deepen their appreciation of the visual aspect of religious traditions and their symbol systems in the variety of their historically and socially contingent contexts of reception.

Bibliography

- Arweck, Elisabeth/Collins, Peter, 2006, *Reading Religion in Text and Context, Reflections of Faith and Practice in Religious Materials*, Aldershot, Burlington, Ashgate.
- Beinhauer-Köhler, Bärbel/Pezzoli-Olgiati, Daria/Valentin, Joachim, 2010, *Religiöse Blicke – Blicke auf das Religiöse. Visualität und Religion*, Zürich, TVZ.
- Belting, Hans, 2000, *Bild und Kult. Eine Geschichte des Bildes vor dem Zeitalter der Kunst*, München, Beck, 5th Ed.
- Belting, Hans, 2001, *Bild-Anthropologie. Entwürfe für eine Bildwissenschaft*, München, Fink.

- Belting, Hans, 2008, *Florenz und Bagdad, Eine westöstliche Geschichte des Blicks*, München, Beck, 2nd Ed.
- Beyer, Andreas, 1996, "Künstler ohne Hände – Fastenzeit der Augen? Ein Beitrag zur Ikonologie des Unsichtbaren", in: Stöhr, Jürgen (ed.), *Ästhetische Erfahrung heute*, Köln, Dumont, 340–359.
- Blizek, William L., 2009, *The Continuum Companion to Religion and Film*, London, New York, Continuum.
- Böhm, Gottfried, 2004, *Jenseits der Sprache? Anmerkungen zur Logik der Bilder*, in: Maar, Christa/Burda, Hubert (ed.), *Iconoc Turn. Die neue Macht der Bilder*, Köln, DuMont, 2nd Ed., 28–43.
- Bräunlein, Peter J., 2004, "Bildakte, Religionswissenschaft im Dialog mit einer neuen Bildwissenschaft", in: Luchesi, Brigitte/von Stuckrad, Kocku (ed.), *Religion im kulturellen Diskurs – Religion in Cultural Discourse*, Festschrift für Hans Kippenberg zu seinem 65. Geburtstag, Berlin, New York, de Gruyter, 195–231.
- Cancik, Hubert/Mohr, Hubert 1988, "Religionsästhetik", in: Cancik, Hubert/Gladigow, Burkhard/Laubacher, Matthias (ed.), *Handbuch religionswissenschaftlicher Grundbegriffe*, Vol. I: Systematischer Teil, Stuttgart, Berlin, Köln, Mainz, Kohlhammer, 121–156.
- Hoover, Steward M., 2006, *Religion in the Media Age, (Media, Religion, and Culture)*, London, New York, Routledge.
- Landwerd, Susanne, 2002, *Religionsästhetik, Studien zum Verhältnis von Symbol und Sinnlichkeit*, Würzburg, Königshausen & Neumann.
- Macho, Thomas, 2000, *Tod und Trauer im kulturwissenschaftlichen Vergleich*, in: Assmann, Jan, *Der Tod als Thema der Kulturtheorie. Todesbilder und Totenriten im Alten Ägypten*, Frankfurt, Suhrkamp, 89–119.
- Miles, Margaret R., 1985, *Image as Insight. Visual Understanding in Western Christianity and Secular Culture*, Eugene, Wipf and Stock.
- Mitchell, W.J.T., 1986, *Iconology. Image, Text, Ideology*, London, The University of Chicago Press.
- Morgan, David, 1998, *Visual Piety. A History and Theory of Popular Religious Images*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, London, University of California Press.
- Morgan, David, 2005, *The Sacred Gaze, Religious Visual Culture in Theory and Practice*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, London, University of California Press.
- Morgan, David (ed.), 2008, *Key Words in Religion, Media and Culture*, London, New York, Routledge.
- Pattison, Stephen, 2007, *Seeing Things: Deepening Relations with Visual Artefacts*, London, SCM Press.
- Plate, S. Brent, 2002, *Religion, Art, and Visual Culture, A Cross-cultural Reader*, New York, Palgrave.

Part I
Perspectives from the Study of Religion

Introduction

Anna-Katharina Höpflinger

Marie-Therese Mäder

The first part of this book focuses on a range of different methodological approaches to visual sources within the study of religion. Although a study of religions perspective is characterised by a comparative approach to visual sources, a diversity of methodological approaches is required to answer the variety of questions that arise in this complex field. Amidst the diversity of approaches and questions considered by the contributors to this volume, however, a common thread may still be detected, in the recurrent interest in a functional approach to religion.

Such an approach to religion and visibility focuses on religion as a system of orientation, creating meaning in human existence and providing a cognitive setting which is reliable for individuals as well as for communities. Moreover, the term religion envelops, in the context we are using it here, a certain tension between immanence and transcendence. Embedded within this general functional frame, the following articles also share some presuppositions and terminology that derive from such a theoretical perspective.

In the contributions that follow, images are understood as a form of visual communication, as indispensable sources to understand religion as an element of culture. Several forms of communication proceed from, within, and around cultural products, for example: communication between the visual medium and its producers; communication between image, film or artefact and viewers; intertextual communication between different cultural products; communication within the artefact on the textual, image or material level; and communication concerning historical or contemporary context. Such multi-layer communication processes that surround visual media can be divided into three different categories, which help to mirror its complexity, namely, production, distribution and reception. Accordingly, the papers in this collection analyse their case studies with particular reference to the categories of production, distribution and reception.

Production includes the field of fabrication with its social, economic and political conditions as well as the materials and technologies which are employed. Distribution enhances the material and ideological exchange between producers and consumers, between supply and demand, following the rules of marketing strategies and/or traditions. Reception describes the multiple processes of consumption as an exchange between product and consumer. Reception, there-

fore, is a kind of reconstruction of cultural representation. It influences, or at least changes, the perception of the object. The differing scope of production, distribution and reception reflect and take into account the complexity of cultural configurations.

It seems useful, therefore, to analyse visual media in a comprehensive way with special attention paid to the wider cultural setting where the visual source is embedded. The inclusion of a wider cultural context allows a more sharply differentiated analysis of the complex processes accompanying the sources under consideration.

The contributions in this first part treat different visual objects from various cultures and historical settings. In *Images in Images. Self-Reflexivity in Votive Paintings from the 19th Century*, Daria Pezzoli-Olgiati analyses votive paintings. Her research focuses on religious practices and intermedial references. With a sustained focus on visual self-reflexivity, she approaches the visual sources according to the pragmatic dimensions and the functions of the pictures that are represented in the images themselves. Similarly, Anna-Katharina Höpflinger in *From Visibility to Invisibility. A Semiotic Approach to Marduk's Battle against Tiāmat on a Relief from Palmyra* questions the aim and intention of a hidden relief depicting a familiar scene from a widespread mythological narrative. The questions that this paper raises are of concern not simply for the unique, three-dimensional artefact under consideration, but also indicate, more broadly, the significance of inter-mediality when investigating the realm of visual communication. By contrast, Melanie J. Wright in *Material Judaism. Interpreting the Pushke* discusses a commercial artefact produced on an industrial scale. She outlines the complex interplay between distribution, demands and production. The recipient is of central concern in Monika Glavac's approach to caricatures. In *Viewing and Reconstructing Caricatures. The "Other" in Benjamin Roubaud's La leçon de danse* she develops a method for analysing hermeneutical processes and queries the representation of the stranger as "the other".

The contributions dealing with film refer to different areas within film studies. Tommi Mendel considers a documentary film which he himself produced and directed, in *Multilayer Reality in Documentary Film. An Approach towards a Critical Reading of Documentary Films on the Basis of ARUKIHENRO* (T. Mendel, CH 2006). He examines the boundaries of film analysis by questioning "reality" in documentary films. Marie-Therese Mäder in *A Cultural Studies Approach to Film and Religion. Context and Film Analysis of Yes* (S. Potter, GB/USA, 2004) examines the triangular relationship between film production, reception and context. She shows how contextualisation and previous knowledge may influence hermeneutical processes in film viewing and how they shape the message of a film. Fabian Perlini-Pfister's approach focuses on film reception, specifically the process of banning film, in *Censorship as Self-Representation. Interpreting the Banning of I ACCUSE* (W. Liebeneiner, D 1941) in Switzerland. He examines dimensions of

historical contextualisation with a focus on hermeneutical questions about the dialogue between the film and its viewers at a specific time.

In discussing these diverse case studies, this part of the study presents a wide range of examples across different times and cultures. The diversity of case studies correlates with the diversity of possible methodological approaches that enable multi-layered interpretations. The theoretical foundation of the study of religion approach, however, ensures that a common functional thread, focused on production, distribution and reception, binds these diverse case studies into a coherent collection.

Visual media always involve reception by some kind of viewer. A religious studies researcher is both a viewer and a participant in the process of reception. The hermeneutical implications of this observation raise critical questions about the position of the recipient or consumer in the production of meaning. This significant hermeneutical issue forms the final topic of discussion at the conclusion of each of the papers in this section and serves as a bridge to the second part of the present volume.